****

**EEB Evaluation Committee Monthly Meeting Minutes**

***MONDAY May 8, 2023 – 10:08-10:47***

ALL VIRTUAL MEETING – NO MEETING ROOM (recordings posted)

Meeting Materials: [May](https://urldefense.proofpoint.com/v2/url?u=https-3A__app.box.com_s_7yi64qdkxebiwtki1die5ewqdzwlx87a&d=DwMFAg&c=euGZstcaTDllvimEN8b7jXrwqOf-v5A_CdpgnVfiiMM&r=aaNxPJvlCHXR-u3TJXK6PqSaR-JTNt2V1-NqVtaBt7E&m=TKTMgTr8SJ3w8Wi0fZ2shtnFzgpcmvYp_WechJhuJ3w&s=gcHC2PK0EerKI3ehuvC08M8bXiJC8ZZ-UidWLrK0tjM&e=)

**New Link: Join Zoom Meeting** - <https://us02web.zoom.us/j/2534751779>

Phone in: 408/638-0968, Meeting ID: 253 475 1779

Backup only -**Call-In Number: 303/900-3524; WEB Access:** [**www.uberconference.com/skumatz**](http://www.uberconference.com/skumatz)

Join link with video only. *USE PHONE (NOT COMPUTER) FOR VOICE, AND MUTE WHEN NOT SPEAKING*

 *(Backup number – only if primary # doesn’t work –* [*https://zoom.us/j/2534751779*](https://zoom.us/j/2534751779)*; and use computer for voice.*

**COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES**

**Attendees:** Viglione\*, Fay\* Alim\*; Lawrence, Reed, Sherwood, Mosenthal; Williams, Errichetti, Emerick, Winterkorn; Prahl, Jacobs, Kroll, Skumatz, Wirtshafter; Fabuien (CMC Energy), Robertson (Artis Energy Solutions), Michael (Illume) van Boekhold (illume); John Greeno (Posigen);

1. **Call to Order – 10:08**
2. **Public Comment - None**
3. **Minutes and invoices and evotes**
	1. April Minutes – already distributed & evoted
	2. Invoices to be circulated separately for evote
4. **Committee Approval of Legislative Report**
	1. Review / approval of Legislative Report before sending to EEB
		* **PASSED - Motion / Second by Viglione / Fay**: Votes in favor Viglione & Fay (DEEP not yet in attendance). Approved
5. **Status of Evaluation Studies**
	1. Study reviews for May 15 deadline
	2. Other studies / beginning. Kickoff “next measures” study tomorrow. Starting others after this crunch. Conflict for the Next Measures Study (C&I committee meeting). After the meeting, the Kickoff Meeting was changed to 1 week later.
	3. Study budget issues – HES’s analyses / reanalyses are adding up; EA may come to the committee with changed Evaluation Budgets.

**Studies Status**

**FINAL REPORTS**

1. X1942B – HP NEIs (sent 4/24)
2. C2117 – Retrocommissioning (coming soon)
3. R1983 – HES & IE Impact & Process (by 6/1)

**REVIEW DRAFT REPORTS FOR COMMENT**

1. X2001B – Res & Com’l Measure Life / EUL; out 4/21 (due 5/5)
2. C2014B – C&I Lighting Phase 2 NTG; out 4/24 (due 5/8)
3. C1906B – SEM; out 4/24 (due 5/8)
4. R1982A – Heat Pump Metering; out 4/26 (5/10)
5. X1942C – HES&IE NEIs; out 4/26 (due 5/10)
6. R1968 – RNC Baseline& Code Compliance; out 4/27 (due 5/11)
7. X1942D - SBEA NEIs; sent 4/28 (due 5/12)
8. X1939 – Early Retirement Phase 2 – Out by 5/12, final by 6/1
9. C1902C – ECB NTG – out by 5/12, final by 6/1
10. Also SAW Behavioral study – may / may not be part of this cycle, depending on utilities
11. **Committee Review of Memos related to Conditions of Approval / Data etc.**
	1. Report on Quarterly Performance Tracking for utilities on data requests and POs –
		* Quick update from Ryan Kroll – research nearly done – follow-up discussions, results final next week or two.
	2. Discussion of progress for 2nd Condition on Data
		* Evaluation Study on data to begin soon
		* Utilities and EA have been meeting regularly and expect to give an update in July.
12. **Highlights / implications of Recent Evaluation Reports**
	1. Highlights of recent evaluation report
		* Kroll – Summarized the result of the EULs study (X2001B – residential & commercial measure life study). Slides attached.
		* Skumatz – Skumatz noted that a first draft of the Behavioral program impact study (called DEI study) is showing savings that are not statistically different from zero; an issue. Kiersten Williams followed up; multi-state study; draft study and utilities still reviewing it. Savings from the 1st year were very small also, but they expected more in the second year. A revised draft will be supplied to the management team and EA prior to review by the Committee.
13. **Other quick updates for committee – discussion** 5 min
	1. Progress on report-posting – keep us posted on additional studies with broken links.
		* Lisa assigning staff for comprehensive review – finding ones that seem to be posted but are not correct
		* Sherwood noted she’s working on it. Fay in favor of working on this.
	2. Update on data requests / data issues – nothing new.
	3. Report on progress in funding options for data issues –
		* Utilties still checking internally. Skumatz owes the voted-on memo approving the funding and the split to UI, because they’ve had staff turnovera and don’t have the document.
	4. Update on data sharing authorized by EA Team to reduce data requests / leverage data - None
14. **Regular Updates to read ahead of time; not discussed / questions taken as needed**
	1. Interim e-votes and meetings – (bottom of agenda)
	2. Project summary document – separate attachment – not presented
	3. Project Gantt chart – separate attachment – not presented
	4. Data email / contact tracking report – separate attachment - not presented
	5. PO and Data Deadlines Tracking, (Presented quarterly – above / separate item)
	6. Covid Updates from utilities, if any - assume none.
	7. Other
15. **Other business** - none
16. **Adjourn** - MOTION / SECOND (Fay /Alim) to adjourn meeting. Voted / passed by Fay & Alim at 10:47. Adjourned.

\*\*\* Supporting Materials to be included in Box folder and attached before meeting, including:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| * Updated Gantt Chart & Project Status Summary & data timeline report (sent, separate doc)
* E-votes / call notes (attached / bottom of agenda)
* Table of COA data/PO performance by utilities
* Slides for presentation
 | * April minutes (separate doc, sent for Evote in April)
* Invoices (to be sent for vote, separate doc)
* Google Doc on status of all Eval plan projects – to be updated / Posted
* Legislative report
 |

***Summary of 2022-23 Votes To Date –Updated***

|  | Minutes for the month | SERA Invoice |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Apr 2023 | *Approved – sent for evote 4/10, resent 4/18. In favor (Fay 4/10, Viglione 4/18, McMillan 4/18)*  |  |
| Mar 2023 | *Approved – Sent for evote 3/13; resent 4/5; responded in favor (Fay, Viglione, McMillan 4/5)* | *Approved – Sent for evote 4/18. In favor (Fay, Viglione, McMillan 4/18)* |
| Feb 2023 | *Approved – Emailed 2/14; responded in favor: Fay & Viglione 2/14, Sickinger 2/15* | *Approved – Sent for evote 4/18. In favor (Fay, Viglione, McMillan 4/18)* |
| Jan 2023 | *Approved – Emailed 1/9; responded: Sickinger in favor 1/9. Resent 2/6/23. Fay & Viglione in favor 2/6,*  | *Approved – Sent for evote 4/18. In favor (Fay, Viglione, McMillan 4/18)* |
| Dec 2022 | *Approved (12/12 Viglione & Fay; 12/13 Sickinger)* | *Approved – (12/16 by Viglione, Fay, Sickinger); true up to be provided with Jan invoice.* |
| Nov 2022 | *Approved (11/8 Viglione & Donatelli; 11/9 Fay)* | *Approved - (12/16 by Viglione, Fay, Sickinger)* |
| Oct 2022 | *Approved: Fay 10/10, Viglione 10/11; DEEP abstain.* | *Appproved - (12/16 by Viglione, Fay, Sickinger)* |
| Sept 2022 | *Approved:10/12, Viglione 10/17, Donatelli 10/17.*  | *Approved: Fay 10/14, Donatelli 10/17, Viglione 10/28.*  |
| Aug 2022 | *Approved – via evote: Fay 8/23, McLean 8/24, Dube only voted for invoice* | *Approved – via evote: Fay 8/23, McLean 8/24, Dube 8/24; directly forwarded to Exec Sec. Approved revised format: Fay 10/12, Viglione 10/17, Donatelli - 10/17* |
| July 2022 |  *Approved –via evote: Donatelli 7/21, Fay 7/22, Viglione 7/25; resent to McLean 7/25.* | *Will evote for easier record-keeping.* |
| June 2022 | *Approved: Emailed out evote 6/15/22. Approved McLean, Viglione, Fay via email 6/16/22. Resent to Donatelli 7/5/22. In favor Donatelli 7/18* | *Approved (after meeting via evote):* Distributed evote 7/13, votes in favor received from Fay (7/13), McLean (7/14), Donatelli (7/18), Viglione (7/18).  |
| May 2022 | *Approved: Distributed prior to meeting / committee wants to e-vote; sent 6/15/22. Approved McLean, Viglione, Fay via email 6/16/22. Resent to Donatelli 7/5/22. In favor Donatelli 7/18* | *Approved: Distributed prior to June meeting / committee wants to e-vote; sent 6/15/22. Approved McLean, Viglione, Fay via email 6/16/22. Resent to Donatelli 7/5/22. In favor Donatelli 7/18* |
| Apr 2022 | *Approved: In May Committee Meeting 5/9/22: - Motion / Second by Fay/McLean. In favor* McLean, Fay, Viglione, Donatelli (none against, none abstaining)– unanimous approval  | *Approved: In May Committee Meeting 5/9/22: - Motion / Second by Fay/Viglione. In favor* McLean, Fay, Viglione, Donatelli (none against, none abstaining)– unanimous approval  |
| Mar 2022 | *Approved – Evotes of yes from McLean, Viglione, Fay, and Donatelli, 4/28.*  | *Approved – Evotes of yes from McLean, Viglione, Fay, and Donatelli, 4/28.*  |
| Feb 2022 | *Approved: Sent for Evote 2/9/22; Approved McLean & Donatelli 2/9/22; Viglione and Fay 2/10/22* | *Approved: yes on 3/14 for all voters McLean, Viglione, Fay, and Donatelli.* |
| Jan 2022 | *Approved: Sent for evote after Jan 2022 meeting: Sent 1/10, 2/4; Approved McLean 2/5, Donatelli 2/7; awaiting Viglione (assume no vote Fay)* | *Approved: Sent for Evote 2/9/22; Approved McLean & Donatelli 2/9/22; Viglione and Fay 2/10/22* |
| Dec 2021 | *Approved: Sent for evote after Jan 2022 meeting: Sent 1/10, 2/4; Approved McLean 2/5, Donatelli 2/7; awaiting Viglione (assume no vote Fay)* | *Approved: Sent both portions for evote 12/17. Approved Donatelli, Viglione, McLean 12/17.* |
| Nov 2021 | *Approved: Sent 12/14. Approved McLean 12/16, Viglione 12/17, Donatelli, 1/10.* | *Approved: Sent 12/14. Approve Donatelli, McLean 12/16. Viglione 1/10* |
| Oct 2021 | *Approved: Sent 12/14. Approved McLean 12/16, Viglione 12/17, Donatelli 1/10.* | *Approved: Sent for evote 11/23, resent 11/30 (Approved McLean, Donatelli on 11/30, Viglione 1/10).* |
| Sept 2021 | *Approved: July/Aug/Sept sent 9/26 for evote; (Sept amended, then approved 9/27 Donatelli & McLean) Awaiting Viglione.* | *Approved: Sent for evote 10/26. Approved McLean 10/26, Donatelli on 10/27, Viglione 1/10).* |
| Aug 2021 | *Approved: July/Aug/Sept sent 9/26 for evote; approved 9/27 Donatelli & McLean, Viglione 1/10)* | *Approved: July/Aug sent for evote 9/13. (Approved McLean 9/14. Evote resent to others 9/26; Donatelli approved 9/27, Viglione 1/10).* |
| July 2021 | *Approved: July/Aug/Sept sent 9/26 for evote approved 9/27 Donatelli & McLean, Viglione 1/10).* | *Approved: July/Aug sent for evote 9/13. (Approved McLean 9/14. Evote resent to others 9/26; Donatelli approved 9/27, Viglione 1/10).* |
| Jun 2021 | *Approved - May and June Minutes-Sent for e-vote 7/1/21, 8/9/21, 9/9 (In favor, Donatelli, 9/7, Viglione 8/9, Resent, McLean approved 9/26)* | *Approved – Combined Apr/May/June sent for evote 9/3, (in favor Donatelli and Viglione 9/4, 9/7, resent 9/9, 9/26; McLean approved 9/26)*  |
| May 2021 | *Approved - Sent for e-vote 7/1/21, 8/9/21, 9/9 (In favor, Donatelli, 9/7, Viglione 8/9; Resent, McLean approved 9/26)* | *Approved – Combined Apr/May/June Sent for evote 9/3, (in favor Donatelli and Viglione 9/4, 9/7), resent 9/9, 9/26; McLean approved 9/26)* |
| April 2021 | *Approved - Sent for evote 4/12, 4/22 (In favor, Wells, McLean, and Viglione 4/22/21)* | *Approved – Combined Apr/May/June Sent for evote 9/3, (in favor Donatelli and Viglione 9/4, 9/7), resent 9/9, 9/26; McLean approved 9/26)* |
| Mar 2021 | *Approved, sent for evote 3,8, 4/12, 4/22 (In favor, Wells, Viglione 4/22/21, McLean abstain)* | *Approved, Sent for evote 4/12, 4/22 (In favor, Wells, McLean, and Viglione 4/22/21)* |
| Feb 2021 | *Passed. Sent for Evote 2/8, 3/8, 4/12, 7/1 (In Favor: McLean 3/8, Viglione 3/8, Wells 7/1)* | *Approved, Sent for evote 4/12, 4/22 (In favor, Wells, McLean, and Viglione 4/22/21)* |
| Jan 2021 | *Passed. Sent for Evote 2/8, 3/8, 4/12, 7/1 (In Favor: McLean 3/8, Viglione 3/8, Wells 7/1)* | *Approved, Sent for Evote 2/8, 3/8, 4/12, 4/22 (In favor, Wells, McLean, and Viglione 4/22/21)* |

**Other Votes / Meetings / Tracking (2022-2023) Updated**

**May 2023**

* **5/9, Kickoff ‘Next Measures”, 3-4pm**

**Apr 2023**

* 4/4 – Interim presentation on X2244, Review possible shift from EE to GHG policy integration goals and metrics at the State level

**Mar 2023**

**Feb 2023**

* 2/6 – update on C1983 HES Impact results to Residential Committee
* 2/1 – preview update on C1983 HES Impact results to Eval Committee/EEB

**Jan 2023 –**

* 1/11 - Eval Update to EEB
* 1/6 – comments for X1942 NEI study draft due

**Dec 2022 –**

* 12/14 Res Kickoffs:
	+ R2209 – RNC NTG
	+ R2213 – Delivered fuels impact eval methods
* 12/14 3 HP Kickoffs:
	+ R2246 – Res HP Metering (joint states)
	+ C2230 – Com’l HP & Electrif
	+ X2231 – Cross cutting HP & Electrif
* 12/14 Cross-cutting Kickoff
* 12/13 Commercial Kickoffs
	+ C2203 – Ag market & Baseline Assessment
	+ C2211 – BES Impact & Process Eval
	+ C2201 – C&I baseline

**12/12/16 – Approved by Eval Committee: SERA Scope of work and budget approved by evote – 12/12 (Viglione and Fay), 12/13 (Sickinger).**

**Nov 2022 –**

* Multiple UI Data Dictionary meetings, Utility / TC pre-interviews for project scope refinements before kickoff.
* Multiple kickoffs to be scheduled this month.
* **VOTE HELD in meeting 11/7/22. MOTION passed:** Fay moved that the memo should pass Evaluation Committee and be forwarded / recommended to EEB. Seconded by Viglione. Fay and Viglione in favor. DEEP abstained (as the document is ultimately filed to them).
* **MOTION PASSED*, Evaluation Committee, 11/7/22 meeting:*** *Revise and replace the motion passed last month by the Evaluation Committee. Approve $180,000 additional budget to reimburse for additional costs (nearly all due to data-related issues), and pull the funding from Study X2234 (Emerging Issues). X2234 has $248K in the Updated 2022 Evaluation Plan. Over the next 3-6 months, the utilities, DEEP, EA, and others will work to identify possible funding sources that will allow reimbursement to Project X2234 of the data portions of these costs, and will report back to the Evaluation Committee monthly, and inform EEB periodically. The data-related costs were allocated as: $39,260 from Eversource, $121,040 from UI.*

**Oct 2022 –**

* **Passed 2022 Eval Plan Update** / no budget change, and contract projects. Move Plan’s budget forward to EEB. In favor: Fay 10/4, Viglione 10/5, Donatelli 10/5.
* **Passed 2022 Eval Plan** Update budget – by EEB 10/12.
* **Motion to increase NMR Budget** by $180,000 with funding to come from sources other than C&LM Plan or Evaluation Budget. In favor: Fay 10/4, Viglione 10/5; DEEP raised issue that Committee and EEB lack authority to address funds outside C&LM Plan or Evaluation budget. Viglione (10/6) and Fay 10/6 interested in efforts to identify other sources; consider issue also at EEB.
* Multiple UI Data Dictionary meetings, Utility / TC pre-interviews for project scope refinements before kickoff.

**Sept 2022 –**

* 9/12 – EUL (X2001) and NEI (X1942) presentation – cancelled, will be incorporated into full report’s final presentation early 2023.
* 9/15 – 11am, Com’l refrigerator presentation (X1931-5)
* 9/15 – 1pm, C1902 A and B – ECB NTG, Baseline, code compliance study – presentation of NTG and baseline/compliance results developed in memos.
* 9/20 – 12pm, R2015, Low load Zero net energy report final presentation,
* 9/29 – 3:30pm, X2022, Engagement / Workforce report final presentation

**Aug 2022** –

* 8/4 training repeated for new contractors by EA
* 8/1 review draft R2015 released

**July 2022 –**

* **7/29 training for new contractors by EA**
* **Approved: Legislative Report:** Distributed evote 7/13, votes in favor received from Fay (7/13), McLean (7/14), Donatelli (7/18), Viglione (7/18). Sent for posting to Exec Secretary 7/20.
* **Approved: Award of C&I baseline study to DNV per memo recommendation.** Distributed evote 7/13, votes in favor received from Fay (7/13), McLean (7/14), Donatelli (7/18), Viglione (7/18). Documentation to contract for this project sent to utilties by EA 7/22/22.
* Presentation of X1939 to C&I meeting held 8/13.

**June 2022 –**

* Meetings with EA and utilities on DNV project on reformatting (and some updates) to the PSD
* 6/8 – Update to EEB on Evaluation committee
* 6/8 – R1965/2027 HP presentation in Residential Committee
* 6/1 - EEB onboarding meeting

**May 2022** –

* Multiple review draft studies out and comments received. See 5/15 table.

**April 2022 –**

* Comments on Conditions of Approval 4/25, 4/27- not passed by EEB
* ***PASSED*** – Approval of winners of 3 year research area contracts – evote – April 27 – May 3, favor: Viglione, Fay, McLean; abstained Donatelli. Passing contract docs to utilities for contracting.

**Mar 2022 –**

* 3/10/22 3:30, Kickoff C2117 RCx Persistence Study Kickoff
* 3/4/22, 2pm, R1968 RNC Baseline & code compliance - Kickoff meeting (follow-up only for folks that couldn’t attend previous kickoff)

**Feb 2022 –**

* **VOTE / PASSED 2/10**: Agree to have project R1968 cover 2015 code update, add MF sample, and adopt the optional task for $20K addition, from the project X2234 “Emerging issues” from the 2022-24 Evaluation Plan (mentioned in the discussion included in the attached minutes; I have also attached the rationale memo from NMR) - Evotes from Donatelli & McLean 2/9; Fay and Viglione 2/10
* **VOTE / PASSED 2/10**: Agree to award the R1968 Phase 2 work to NMR on its existing PO, awarding project R2215 funds of $300K to allow smooth continuation of the project / no gap.  This awards the funds from a 2022-24 project to that existing PO. (minutes describe advantages) – Evotes from Donatelli & McLean 2/9; Fay and Viglione 2/10
* 2/15/22 R1968 RNC Baseline & code compliance - Kickoff meeting
* Special data meetings R1983 / UI
* 2/4/22 - Meetings on C&I verification refinement suggestion from CIE (Jan and Feb and ongoing)
* 2/3/22 - TRM meeting on level of detail of results for R1983 realization rates

**Jan 2022 –**

* 1/10 Stakeholder briefing for Phase 2 directions for R2015 (low load residential homes).
* 1/10 **APPROVED** EVALUATION PLAN, REVISED, by evaluation committee. In meeting.
* 1/12 Briefing with EEB on Evaluation Plan.
* 1/12 – **APPROVED BY EEB VOTE**
	+ 3-year Evaluation Plan and Budget - $14.775 million ($4.5 million, $4.5 million, $5.775 million across the 3 years)
	+ EA team budget – 2022=$444,110; 2023=$444,110; 2024=$531,155.
	+ EA Team scope of work; provided to utilities.
* Meetings on C&I verification refinement suggestion from CIE (Jan and Feb and ongoing; including C&I meeting, January)